

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----X

RIVENDELL WINERY, LLC, and SUSAN L. WINE,

Plaintiff,

-against-

09-cv-00547 (DNH) (DRH)

THE TOWN OF NEW PALTZ, THE ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS OF THE TOWN OF NEW PALTZ, LINDA DONOVAN, individually, GAIL CHRISTMAN individually, PATRICIA SCHWARTZ, individually, ROBERT HUGHES, individually, JEFFREY CLOCK, individually, THOMAS WIACEK, individually, RODNEY WATROUS individually, KEVIN C. HARP, individually, SUSAN ZIMET, individually, THE COUNTY OF ULSTER, individually, and “JANE DOES” 1-8, individually and personally, representing the fictitious or partially fictitious names of individuals, whose full names are unknown to the Plaintiffs,

Defendants.

-----X

**TOWN DEFENDANTS’ REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW
IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO DISMISS COMPLAINT**

Rice & Amon
Attorneys for Defendants Town of New Paltz,
Zoning Board of Appeals of the Town of New
Paltz, Linda Donovan, individually, Linda
Christman, individually, Patricia Schwartz,
individually, Robert Hughes, individually,
Jeffrey Clock, individually, Thomas Wiacek,
individually, Rodney Watrous, individually
Four Executive Boulevard
Suite 100
Suffern, New York 10901
(845) 357-4000

Terry Rice

TABLE OF CONTENTS

FACTS	1
POINT I	
STANDARD FOR SUFFICIENCY OF COMPLAINT	5
POINT II	
CLAIMS BARRED BY ISSUE PRECLUSION	6
POINT III	
PLAINTIFFS' CLAIMS ARE NOT RIPE	6
POINT IV	
THE COMPLAINT FAILS TO STATE A CLAIM PURSUANT TO THE FIRST AMENDMENT RIGHT TO PETITION GOVERNMENT FOR THE REDRESS OF GRIEVANCES OR ARTICLE I, § 9 OF THE NEW YORK CONSTITUTION	11
POINT V	
PLAINTIFFS LACK A PROPERTY OR LIBERTY INTEREST	12
POINT VI	
THE COMPLAINT DOES NOT STATE A PROCEDURAL DUE PROCESS CLAIM	14
POINT VII	
THE COMPLAINT FAILS TO STATE A SUBSTANTIVE DUE PROCESS CLAIM	18
A. Equal Protection, First Amendment Claims Precludes Substantive Due Process Claim	18
B. The Complaint Fails to State a Substantive Due Process Claim	18
A. Because of the Existence of Available Judicial Review, A Substantive Due Process Claim is Not Stated	24

POINT VIII

THE COMPLAINT FAILS TO STATE AN EQUAL PROTECTION CLAIM 24

A. A Class of One Equal Protection Claim Cannot be Premised On a Discretionary Determination 27

B. The Complaint Fails to Sufficiently Allege the Existence of Similarly Situated Persons Treated Differently 25

C. Intentional Discrimination Not Alleged 26

D. Vindictive Action Necessary 26

E. Conclusion 26

POINT IX

THE COMPLAINT FAILS TO ALLEGE A CONSPIRACY CLAIM PURSUANT TO 42 U.S.C. § 1983 27

POINT X

THE MEMBERS OF THE ZONING BOARD OF APPEALS, SUED IN THEIR INDIVIDUAL CAPACITIES ARE ENTITLED TO DISMISSAL OF THE ACTION AGAINST THEM BECAUSE OF ABSOLUTE QUASI-JUDICIAL IMMUNITY 27

POINT XI

EACH INDIVIDUAL DEFENDANT IS ENTITLED TO QUALIFIED IMMUNITY 29

POINT XII

STATE CLAIMS 30

CONCLUSION 30

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Federal Decisions

<i>Acierno v. Cloutier</i> , 40 F.3d 597 (3d Cir. 1994)	10, 10 n.2
<i>Aschroft v. Ibqal</i> , 129 S.Ct. 1937 (2009)	5
<i>Bateson v. Geisse</i> , 857 F.2d 1300 (9 th Cir. 1988)	28
<i>Bell Atlantic Corp. v. Twombly</i> , 550 U.S. 544 (2007)	2, 5, 26 n.9
<i>Bello v. Walker</i> , 840 F.2d 1124 (3d Cir. 1988)	19
<i>Blain v. Twp. of Radnor</i> , 167 Fed.Appx 330 (3d Cir.2006)	21
<i>Brady v. Town of Colchester</i> , 863 F.2d 205 (2d Cir. 1988)	13, 19 n.6
<i>Brown v. City of Ecorse</i> , 322 Fed.Appx. 443 (6 th Cir. 2009)	14
<i>Brown v. City of Pittsburgh</i> , 325 Fed.Appx. 57 (3d Cir. 2009)	5
<i>Christian v. Town of Riga</i> , 2009 WL 2567818 (W.D.N.Y. 2009)	14
<i>City of Eastlake v. Forest City Enterprises</i> , 426 U.S. 668 (1976)	13 n.13
<i>Conley v. Gibson</i> , 355 U.S. 41 (1957)	5
<i>Corneal v. Jackson Township</i> , 313 F.Supp.2d 457 (M.D.Pa. 2003), <i>aff'd</i> , 94 Fed.Appx. 79 (3d Cir.), <i>cert. denied</i> , 543 U.S. 871 (2004)	19, 21
<i>County Concrete Corp. v. Town of Roxbury</i> , 442 F.3d 159 (3d Cir. 2006)	29
<i>Country View 154 Estates @ Ridge LCC</i> , 452 F.Supp.2d 142 (E.D.N.Y. 2006)	8
<i>Crippen v. Town of Hempstead</i> , 2009 WL 803117 (E.D.N.Y. 2009)	25 n.8
<i>Dix v. City of New York</i> , 2002 WL 31175251 (S.D.N.Y. 2002)	8
<i>Dougherty v. Town of North Hempstead Board of Zoning Appeals</i> , 282 F.3d 83 (2d Cir. 2002)	12 n.3
<i>Dunn v. Prince</i> , 2009 WL 1024612 (5 th Cir. 2009)	5
<i>Dyno v. Village of Johnson City</i> , 240 Fed.Appx. 432 (2d Cir. 2007), <i>cert. denied</i> , 128 S.Ct. 1874 (2008)	6

<i>Easter Seal Society of New Jersey, Inc. v. Township of North Bergen</i> , 798 F.Supp. 228 (D.N.J. 1992)	9
<i>Ecogen, LLC v. Town of Italy</i> , 438 F.Supp.2d 149 (W.D.N.Y. 2006)	7, 8
<i>Eichenlaub v. Township of Indiana</i> , 385 F.3d 274 (3d Cir. 2004)	20, 20 n.6
<i>Eidson v. State of Tennessee Dept. of Children's Services</i> , 510 F.3d 631 (6 th Cir. 2007)	5
<i>Experimental Holdings, Inc. v. Farris</i> , 503 F.3d 514 (6th Cir.2007)	14
<i>Freeman v. Guy</i> , 303 Fed.Appx. 358 (7 th Cir. 2008)	5
<i>Garden City Center Associates v. Village of Garden City</i> , 189 F.3d 460 (Table), 1999 WL 642782 (2d Cir. 1999)	6
<i>Gaskins v. Santorum</i> , 324 Fed.Appx. 147 (3d Cir. 2009)	5
<i>Gagliardi v. Village of Pawling</i> , 18 F.3d 188 (2d Cir. 1994)	12 n.3
<i>Gilbert v. City of Cambridge</i> , 932 F.2d 51 (1st Cir.), <i>cert. denied</i> , 502 U.S. 866 (1991)	8
<i>Goldfine v. Kelly</i> , 80 F.Supp.2d 153 (S.D.N.Y. 2000)	8
<i>Hampton Bays Connections, Inc. v. Duffy</i> , 127 F.Supp.2d 364 (E.D.N.Y. 2001)	12 n.3
<i>Haskel v. Washington Township</i> , 864 F.2d 1266 (6 th Cir. 1988)	28
<i>Homefront Organization, Inc. v. Motz</i> , 570 F.Supp.2d 398 (E.D.N.Y. 2008)	8, 9
<i>Johnston v. Dauphin Borough</i> , 2006 WL 1410766 (M.D.Pa. 2006)	19
<i>Lauderbaugh v. Hopewell Township</i> , 319 F.3d 568 (3d Cir. 2002)	10
<i>Levin v. Upper Makefield Township</i> , 2003 WL 21652301 (E.D.Pa 2003), <i>aff'd</i> , 90 Fed.Appx. 653 (3d Cir.), <i>cert. denied</i> , 543 U.S. 1035 (2004)	22
<i>Lindquist v. Buckingham Township</i> , 2003 WL 22757894 (E.D.Pa 2003), <i>aff'd</i> , 106 Fed.Appx. 768 (3d Cir. 2004), <i>cert. denied</i> , 543 U.S 1121 (2005)	21
<i>Lucas v. South Carolina Coastal Council</i> , 505 U.S. 1003 (1992)	7
<i>Manufactured Home Communities Inc. v. City of San Jose</i> , 420 F.3d 1022 (9th Cir.2005)	7, 8

<i>Maple Properties, Inc. v. Township of Upper Providence</i> , 151 Fed.Appx. 174 (3d Cir. 2005)	20
<i>Moccio v. New York State Office of Court Admin.</i> , 95 F.3d 195 (2d Cir.1996)	6
<i>Murphy v. New Milford Zoning Commission</i> , 402 F.3d 342 (2d Cir. 2005)	7
<i>Oblin Homes, Inc. v. Village of Dobbs Ferry</i> , 935 F.Supp. 497 (S.D.N.Y.1996), <i>aff'd</i> , 133 F.3d 907 (2d Cir. 1997)	14
<i>Old St. George's LLC v. Bianco, slip op.</i> 08 Civ. 5321 (S.D.N.Y. 2009)	4
<i>Orange Lake Assoc., Inc. v. Kirkpatrick</i> , 21 F.3d 1214 (2d Cir.1994)	14
<i>PFZ Properties v. Rodrigues</i> , 928 F.2d 28 (1 st Cir. 1991), <i>cert. dismissed</i> , 503 U.S. 257 (1992)	21
<i>Phifer v. City of New York</i> , 289 F.3d 49 (2d Cir. 2002)	6
<i>Ramos v. City of New York</i> , 298 Fed.Appx. 84 (2d Cir. 2008)	5
<i>Reahard v. Lee County</i> , 30 F.3d 1412 (11 th Cir. 1994)	9
<i>Richardson v. Township of Brady</i> , 218 F.3d 508 (6 th Cir. 2000)	14
<i>Ridgeview Partners, LLC v. Entwhistle</i> , 227 Fed.Appx. 80 (2d Cir.), <i>cert. denied</i> , 128 S.Ct. 668 (2007)	11
<i>Riverdale Realty v. Town of Orangetown</i> , 816 F.Supp. 937 (S.D.N.Y. 1993)	8
<i>RKO Delaware, Inc. v. City of New York</i> , 2001 WL 1329060 (E.D.N.Y. 2001)	8
<i>Robinson v. Limerick Township</i> , 2005 WL 627880 (E.D.Pa 2005), <i>aff'd</i> , 188 Fed.Appx. 149 (3d Cir. 2006)	20
<i>Robinson v. Limerick Township</i> , 2005 WL 17972 (E.D.Pa. 2005)	23
<i>RRI Realty Corp. v. Village of Southampton</i> , 870 F.2d 911 (2d Cir.), <i>cert. denied</i> , 493 U.S. 893 (1989)	13, 13 n.4
<i>Ruston v. Town Board of the Town of Skaneateles</i> , 2008 WL 5423038 (N.D.N.Y. 2008)	19 n.6, 20 n.7
<i>S & R Development Estates, LLC v. Bass</i> , 588 F.Supp.2d 452 (S.D.N.Y. 2008)	8, 9
<i>Sameric Corp. of Delaware v. Corporation of Delaware v. City of Philadelphia</i> , 142 F.3d 582 (3d Cir. 1998)	10, 10 n.2

<i>Sammon v. New Jersey Board of Medical Examiners</i> , 66 F.3d 639 (3d Cir. 1995)	9
<i>Scott v. Greenville County</i> , 716 F.2d 1409 (4 th Cir. 1983)	19, n.6
<i>Seymour's Boatyard, Inc. v. Town of Huntington</i> , 2009 WL 1514610 (E.D.N.Y. 2009)	12, 12 n.3
<i>Southview Assocs., Ltd. v. Bongartz</i> , 980 F.2d 84 (2d Cir.1992), <i>cert. denied</i> , 507 U.S. 987 (1993)	7
<i>Spradlin v. Borough of Danville</i> , 2005 WL 3320788 (M.D.Pa. 2005), <i>aff'd</i> , 188 Fed.Appx. 149 (3d Cir. 2006)	20
<i>Suitum v. Tahoe Regional Planning Agency</i> , 520 U.S. 725 (1997)	7
<i>Sullivan v. Town of Salem</i> , 805 F.2d 81 (2d Cir. 1986)	13
<i>Sunrise Corp. of Myrtle Beach v. City of Myrtle Beach</i> , 420 F.3d 322 (4 th Cir. 2005), <i>cert. denied</i> , 547 U.S. 1039 (2006)	15
<i>Tara Circle, Inc. v. Bifano</i> , 1997 WL 399683 (S.D.N.Y. 1997), <i>aff'd</i> , 173 F.3d 846 (2d Cir. 1999)	14
<i>Taylor Investment, Ltd. v. Upper Darby Township</i> , 983 F.2d 1285 (3d Cir.), <i>cert. denied</i> , 510 U.S. 914 (1993)	12, 12 n.2
<i>Thornbury Noble, Ltd. v. Thornbury Township</i> , 112 Fed.Appx. 185 (3d Cir. 2004), <i>cert. denied</i> , 544 U.S. 999 (2005)	20
<i>Tri-State Video Corp. v. Town of Stephentown</i> , 1998 WL 72331 (W.D.N.Y. 1998)	7-8, 8
<i>Triple G Landfills v. Board of Commissioners of Fountain County</i> , 977 F.2d 287 (7th Cir.1992)	8
<i>United Artists Theatre Circuit, Inc. v. Township of Warrington</i> , 316 F.3d 393, <i>rehearing denied</i> , 324 F.3d 133 (3d Cir. 2003)	19, 23
<i>Wachtmeister v. Swiesz</i> , 59 Fed.Appx. 428 (2d Cir.), <i>cert. denied</i> , 540 U.S. 860 (2003)	6
<i>Walz v. Town of Smithtown</i> , 46 F.3d 162 (2d Cir.), <i>cert. denied</i> , 515 U.S. 1131 (1995)	13
<i>Williams v. Smallwood</i> , 301 Fed.Appx. 578 (8 th Cir. 2008)	5
<i>Xikis v. City of New York</i> , 1990 WL 156155 (E.D.N.Y. 1990)	8
<i>Zahra v. Town of Southold</i> , 48 F.3d 674 (2d Cir. 1995)	13

New York State Decisions

<i>Gershowitz v. Planning Board of the Town of Brookhaven</i> , 52 N.Y.2d 763, 436 N.Y.S.2d 612, 417 N.E.2d 1000 (1980)	2
<i>Jamil v. Village of Scarsdale Planning Board</i> , 24 A.D.3d 552, 808 N.Y.S.2d 260 (2d Dept. 2005)	1-2
<i>J & R Esposito Builders v. Coffman</i> , 183 A.D.2d 828, 584 N.Y.S.2d 73 (2d Dept. 1992)	2
<i>Magee v. Town of Stony Point Zoning Board of Appeals</i> , NYLJ, May 10, 2000, p. 35, col. 3 (Sup. Ct. Rockland Co. 2000)	17 n.5
<i>Rattner v. Planning Commission of the Village of Pleasantville</i> , 103 A.D.2d 826, 478 N.Y.S.2d 63 (2d Dept. 1984)	2
<i>Swantz v. Planning Board of the Village of Cobleskill</i> , 34 A.D.3d 1159, 824 N.Y.S.2d 781 (3d Dept. 2006)	1
<i>Vreeland v. Zoning Board of Appeals</i> , 175 A.D.2d 552, 572 N.Y.S.2d 808 (2d Dept. 1991)	17 n.5

New York State Statutes

Agriculture & Markets Act § 301(4)	3, 16
Agriculture & Markets Act § 301(4)(i)	2, 3
Agriculture & Markets Act § 301(9)(a)	3
Agriculture & Markets Act § 301(11)	2
Town Law §§ 267-a(4)	2
Town Law § 267-b	7
Town Law § 267-b(1)	2

Town of New Paltz Zoning Law

§ 140-4	1, 10, 29
§ 140-117.3	1, 10, 16, 29
§ 140-134	1, 10, 16, 29

Secondary Authorities

MCKINNEY'S PRACTICE COMMENTARIES, Town Law § 274-a (2006 Supplement) 2

MCKINNEY'S PRACTICE COMMENTARIES, Town Law § 274-a (2007 Supplement) 2